

**PERSONAL STATEMENT TO BE MADE BY
DEPUTY M.F. DUBRAS OF ST. LAWRENCE
ON 29th NOVEMBER 2005**

“I have been a member of the Deputy Dorey Shadow Scrutiny Panel and its successor the Deputy Southern Shadow Scrutiny Panel since mid 2004.

During that period, I have participated as actively as possible, withdrawing from deliberations only when the matter under scrutiny was directly linked to my responsibilities as a member of the Policy and Resources Committee. This was the case with the extensive scrutiny of the Migration Policy, P.25/2005.

Subsequently, the Deputy Southern Panel decided to produce a Report on Legal Advice to Scrutiny Panels consequent on its experiences and those of other Panels. I did not participate in that decision.

I began to contribute part-way through the drafting phase. I neither actively participated with those sections of the draft report dealing specifically with beliefs, findings and recommendations related to the Migration Policy, (Sections 3.5 to 3.7 inclusive), nor any related text resultant on the Panel’s interview with the H.M. Attorney General which I had not attended, being linked to the P.25/2005 deliberations.

It was recorded in the minutes of the last two meetings I attended that I dissented from some of the conclusions of the then draft report. It had been understood that my dissent would be recorded in the appropriate section (1.2) of the report but I was subsequently advised that the Chairman had decided unilaterally to delete that information, maintaining that position against my wishes and general convention. I understand too it is contrary to a draft protocol agreed by the Chairmen’s Committee for the future.

In view of the content of the now further revised final draft presented to the States on 22nd November 2005, I have no alternative but to distance myself from the report and disassociate myself from the beliefs, findings and recommendations of the panel chaired by Deputy Southern.

I regret very much having to do this as one of my last contributions to this Assembly. To remain silent would be to abdicate my responsibilities.”